

The logo consists of a cluster of small, light blue squares and diamonds arranged in a roughly circular pattern, with some squares missing, creating a fragmented, grid-like appearance. The text 'swiss network for international studies' is positioned to the right of this graphic, in a clean, white, sans-serif font.

swiss  
network for  
international  
studies

# SNIS Project 2011 Working Paper

## Mobile Access to Knowledge: Culture and Safety in Africa.

Documenting and assessing the impact of cultural events  
and public art on urban safety.

By: D. Fornari, F. Alvim, A. Anangwe, E. F. Bonini Lessing, S. Cangiano, L. Cantoni, M. Douala Bell, N. Edjabe, I. Farouk, A. Guyot, I. M. Ruigrok, S. Kandé, C. Liveriero Lavelli, F. Martini, L. Morici, S. Njami, E. A. Pieterse, M. Pucciarelli, I. Rega, D. Schaub, A. Spitz, F. Vanin, C. Wanjiku Kihato

## Working paper

### *Mobile Access to Knowledge: Culture and Safety in Africa.*

#### *Documenting and assessing the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety.*

In this working paper we provide a summary of the content and the comparative results of the research project “Mobile A2K: Culture and Safety in Africa. Documenting and assessing the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety” with a specific focus on the direct and indirect impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety, and on the intentionality of this impact. The research “Mobile A2K: Culture and Safety in Africa. Documenting and assessing the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety” mapped and compared a series of case studies on the cultural production of Douala in Cameroon, Luanda in Angola, and Johannesburg in South Africa, between 1991 and 2013; in these contexts safety is a concern appearing constantly in the background, determined by the presence and fear of criminality and violence, but also by the threat of forced evictions and natural and man-made disasters. The research highlighted that cultural events and public art do have a direct impact on urban safety, by producing works including infrastructural-functional elements, by “making space” (and triggering the establishment of shared spaces) and by contributing to urban branding among niches; artworks can also generate conflicts (with references to historical, political, social and ethnic issues) and it is necessary to mention that the maintenance of infrastructural-functional elements can indeed be a risk in particular for the rapid deterioration of materials in tropical climate. The indirect impact of cultural events and public art is related to their capacity of being an entrance point in informal settlements, to initiate social transformations and to contribute in changing behavior, by triggering relationships, ownership, humanity, empowerment and active citizenship; it is the process, the construction of value and the sense of pride which appear to have a determinant role; few specific artworks present the capacity of establishing a personal relationship with the viewer and they are described as something which “Ça réveille” [it wakes you up]. The most relevant result from an international perspective is that the research has brought out the existence of common patterns in different typologies of productions: *proximity artworks* tend to provide infrastructural-functional elements that can directly respond to safety-related problems; *large-scale sculptures and monuments* tend to be more contested and they can generate conflicts; *urban-scale artworks and cultural events* participate in urban branding. *Artworks in passageways* are specifically relevant: they do not produce direct impact on urban safety, but they are indeed more likely to establish a personal relationship with the viewer, triggering humanity, ownership, empowerment, active citizenship, value, and sense of pride.

### **1.1 Research context and problem**

As the Millennium Development Goals declare, the achievement of a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers is essential. To produce such improvement safety is a priority, as the UN-Habitat publication on enhancing urban safety and security has also presented in 2007 (UN-Habitat, 2007).

How are the arts contributing to this process?

The notion of a relationship between the physical environment and the safety and well-being of its users is not new. From the 1960s various theoretical and behavioral/empirical approaches have explored the nature of this interaction. Today’s approaches draw directly from, amongst others, early incarnations of Jane Jacobs’s “The Death and Life of Great American Cities” (Jacobs, 1961), C. Ray Jeffreys’ concept of “Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design” (CPTED - Jeffreys, 1971) and almost concurrent work by Oscar Newman entitled “Defensible Space; Crime Prevention through Urban Design” (Newman, 1972) through to the 1980s “broken windows” theory of James Wilson and George Kelling (Kelling and Wilson, 1982). Time and research have allowed these approaches to evolve and become more integrated and multi-disciplinary but the endeavor of

mediating the environment and thereby enhancing the social experience of it remains core. CPTED, defensible space, environmental security, security by design, natural crime prevention, safer cities, situational crime prevention, designing out crime and plan-specific crime prevention are concepts centered around the built environment and, indirectly, they take into consideration the role of communities in crime prevention.

In contributing to urban transformation, cultural events and public art can play a specific role. A cultural event is the public happening or presentation of a cultural action (artistic intervention, large-scale exhibition, festival) in a site- and time-specific context; public art is a site-specific temporary or permanent artistic intervention located in public and accessible sites. Whereas galleries are generally quite visually neutral spaces, accessible to a relatively small community of art lovers, public spaces provide a very diverse and much more loaded context for the arts. They are used by many more people, by a greater variety of people and for a greater variety of purposes. The physical and aesthetic qualities of public space are also much more varied than those of the public or private gallery spaces that artists traditionally exhibit their work in.

Cultural events and public art have been produced internationally and research has been contributing to analyze the impact of these productions. The need of public agencies and donors to access metrics and to evaluate the efficiency of cultural investments has played a central role in triggering evaluations. In particular in the United States and the United Kingdom different kind of reports – categorized by Graem Evans in advocacy and promotion, project assessment, project evaluation, program evaluation, performance indicators-PIs, impact assessment and longitudinal impact assessments – have assessed the role of art in the frame of urban regeneration (Evans, 2005); similar reports have highlighted the contribution of art to social impact (Jermyn, 2001; Guetzkow, 2002; Ruiz, 2004; Jeremyn, 2004).

The impact of art in reducing crime and contributing to crime prevention is an element considered by researchers. Crime is mentioned both in the frame of urban regeneration and in the frame of social inclusion; in the frame of social inclusion it is considered as one of the combined problems – with ill-health, unemployment, low income, poor education and housing and family breakdown – which leads to social exclusion (Jermyn, 2004). There are projects and evaluations focusing specifically on art which targets offenders to reduce crime and re-offending (Hughes et al., 2006), but crime reduction is also mentioned more broadly, among the effects of the arts or among the parameters which need to be taken into consideration (Matarasso, 1997 including among the effects of participation in the arts “help offenders and victims address issues of crime“; Williams, 1997 “increased levels of public safety” framed in “activating social change”; HDA, 2000 in “local involvement”; Coalter 2001 as an intermediate outcome; Jermyn, 2001 as a ‘hard’ outcome; Guetzkow, 2002:3; Reeves:2002:30 as indirect social impact; Evans, 2005:13; ixia, 2010:17-18 among the social values; Bower, 2012). In physical regeneration other parameters relate to the issue of urban safety such as “Increased public use of space— reduction in vandalism and an increased sense of safety” (Evans, 2005:13); the effects of art in changing the perception of community safety and on fear of crime are also mentioned as indicators (HDA, 2000; ixia, 2010:18).

Cultural events and public art produced in Africa have remained on a side. Even if several cities have been at the center of major cultural events and of a large production of public art, the documentation about them is still very limited, it is not properly acknowledged at an international level, and its capacity of teaching us something different has not been taken into consideration. At best cultural events based in Africa have been reported as peripheral examples of international phenomena (Vanderlinden and Filipovic, 2006; Storr, 2007; Filipovic et al., 2010).

Producing cultural events and public art in Africa can be very different from producing cultural events and public art elsewhere. Focusing on African cities brings into the discourse issues related to art economy, art system, art and development, land ownership, and the meaning of “public” space. These productions are not peripheral examples of international phenomena: they are case studies which introduce – in the analysis of the role and impact of the arts – contexts largely

characterized by criminality, violence, forced evictions and natural and man made disasters, the major urban threats highlighted by UN-Habitat (UN-Habitat, 2007).

Douala is the location of a major cultural event on public art and of a critical number of public installations conceived in over twenty years (Hanussek, 2001; Malaquais, 2006; Babina and Douala Bell, 2007; Thompson, 2012; Oberhofer, 2012). Johannesburg is at the centre of a policy of urban renovation implemented through cultural initiatives (Miny, 2006; Freschi, 2007; Marschall, 2010; Marie and Cane, 2010). Luanda has assisted in the last seven years to a post-war cultural strategy. In Douala some research has already highlighted the experimental capacity of these experiences of producing livability, civil cohabitation and social cohesion, the main features of urban safety (Williamson, 2005; Sacks, 2006; Siedert and Vierke, 2008). Further knowledge and an interdisciplinary and comparative approach are needed to acknowledge the role and the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety.

## **1.2 Research objectives**

The research “Mobile A2K: Culture and Safety in Africa. Documenting and assessing the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety” was conceived to document and assess the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety in relationship with the Millennium Development Goal 7d (“By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers”).

More specifically the objective of the research were:

1. Documenting and mapping cultural events and public art produced between 1991 and 2013 in the cities of Douala, Luanda and Johannesburg and making this documentation accessible through ICT.
2. Assessing the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety by exploring a series of case studies and comparing them.

Since its very conception, the research did not aim at influencing or providing guidelines for artworks. An asset of the research is that safety is not an objective or an expected result of cultural productions, and it should not be. The arts need to be a space of experimentation and research; analyzing their impact and side effects is a way to highlight the unforeseen, and to take advantage of what a space of freedom can teach us. Without that space of freedom in any case we would not have art.

## **1.3 Research question**

The research focused on the following questions: how do cultural events and public art affect urban safety in African cities? Can we assess these changes as positive according to a group of factors?

## **1.4 Research hypothesis**

The research was based on the hypothesis that the arts are a space for experimentation and research, not directly connected to urban safety, but capable of triggering unforeseen ways of producing higher livability, civil cohabitation and social cohesion.

## **2. Methodology**

To document and assess the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety, the interdisciplinary and comparative research “Mobile Access to Knowledge: Culture and Safety in Africa” worked between December 2011 and June 2014 with literature reviews, field research, visual representations and analysis to collect and then compare findings. The research team was composed of scholars in the fields of arts, communication, design, architecture, anthropology and sociology, and with representatives of institutions working in the three cities involved in collaboratively designing the research methodology.

### **2.1 Urban safety**

In the research we consider “urban safety” as a condition that does not refer exclusively to criminality and crime prevention; we refer to urban safety as higher livability, civil cohabitation and social cohesion.

The reason we have been using since the project plan this definition of urban safety is two-fold: the research does not aim at highlighting the efficiency of military control, gated and guarded areas, and rough justice (three approaches to urban safety which do characterize the three cities at the center of our research); and we rather wanted to focus on the capacity of the arts to contribute to factors considered relevant for crime prevention and for the reduction of urban threats: urban planning, design and governance, community-based approaches, reduction of risk factors by focusing on groups that are likely to be perpetrators and victims of crimes, strengthening social capital, land-use planning, long-term development objectives, public education and information programs (UN-Habitat, 2007).

The observation of urban safety was based on factors identified during the definition of the project’s methodology; those factors relate to the application of the CPTED Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design which is characterized by three strategies: natural access control, natural surveillance and territorial reinforcement (connected to increase the effort to commit crime, to increase the risks associated to crime, to reduce reward and to remove excuses). To apply the concept of CPTED (Crowe, 2000) the space is observed; during this observation meant to transform the space a series of elements are considered: the presence of the police (guards, security personnel and military forces), the demographics of a site (the presence of residents, non residents, commuters, visitors), the patterns of the streets, the presence of vehicles (moving and parking) and pedestrians, the different kinds of buildings (position, doors, windows) and access (entrances, exits, clusters, perimeters, fences, gates), the presence of public transport and public transport stops, telephones, lighting, bathrooms, garbage, maintenance, and the maps of fears, crimes and land-use; crime reports are also collected. Furthermore other factors were observed considering a broader definition of urban safety based on the major safety and security-related threats presented in the 2007 UN-Habitat report Enhancing Urban Safety and Security (UN-Habitat, 2007). The choice of orientating our analysis around this report is due to the applied nature of both our research and this document. The 2007 UN-Habitat report is conceived as a tool to guide and provide best practices with the pragmatic and specific aim of enhancing urban safety and security, considered a priority for governments and the international community; the 2007 UN-Habitat report has also the advantage of referring specifically to “urban safety and security” and taking into consideration a broad spectrum of threats and factors related to crime and violence, insecurity of tenure and forced eviction, and natural and man disasters. We therefore observed the nature of the settlements, the risks of forced evictions, and the risks of natural and man made disasters (risks of flows, car and traffic accidents, epidemics; we looked at the configuration of the sites and the presence of basic services); in collecting information about crime and violence we furthermore considered issues related to corruption and freedom of expression. Data have also been collected about local communities and associations, development projects, community-lead initiatives and community-organized security; the research wanted indeed to take into consideration the social aspects, not only the physical and situational aspects, in accordance with the concept of “community crime prevention” (Hope and Shaw, 1988).

These indicators relate also to the evaluation system of art proposed by ‘Developing Methodologies for Public Art Evaluation’; livability serves in fact as the overarching goal for this goal framework (Bower et al, 2012:72); it is defined as “Livability consists of a variety of factors that contribute to the quality of life in a community such as ample opportunities for social, civic, and cultural participation; education, employment, and safety; sustainability; affordable housing, ease of transportation, and access to public buildings and facilities; and an aesthetically pleasing environment”; the methodology defines five subsequent goal categories (quality of life, community engagement, cultural planning and growth, aesthetic and economic growth and revitalization) to demonstrate the livability of a community; among each category a series of indicators and methods

to collect evidences are listened. The data and content we collected present strong similarities to this approach, but we did not evaluate and compare the parameters by using quantitative metrics. All researchers collected data on criminality in the cities of Douala, Luanda and Johannesburg. When available and when accessible, the official data are not precisely geo-positioned, which does not allow to relate them to the sites of public artworks. Interviews, the survey and images of the sites before and after the installation of public artworks were used to highlight transformations. In particular we looked at how sites changed before and after the installation of public art, the presence of businesses and informal traders, the construction of new buildings, the presence of police and military force, the behaviors and use of the space by whom and at what time. A specific attention was put on the creation of shared spaces and how they changed and were maintained; we also documented if artworks were vandalized or not and if they were repaired. The comparative analysis confronted the findings of our qualitative interviews and case studies in relationship with the three safety and security-related threats highlighted by the UN-Habitat report (UN-Habitat, 2007).

## **2.2 Cultural events and public art**

The research focused on cultural events and public art produced between 1991 and 2013 in Douala (Cameroon), Luanda (Angola) and Johannesburg (South Africa). The case studies highlighted two neighborhoods of Douala at the centre of cultural events and public art (Bessengue from 2001 to 2013 and New Bell from 2002 to 2013); the artworks *Troyeville Bedtime Stories* (2010), *Oppenheimer Park* (2010) and *Diespsloot I Love You* (2011-2012) in Johannesburg; in Luanda the Luanda Triennial (established in 2003, first edition 2006-2007, second edition 2010) and UNAP– União Nacional dos Artistas Plasticos (established in 1987).

The database of cultural events and public art in Douala presents 26 series of public artworks (10 proximity artworks, 9 artworks in passageways, 7 large-scale sculptures and monuments). The database of Johannesburg focuses essentially on public-lead artworks, it presents 54 series of public artworks (23 large-scale sculptures and monuments and 31 artworks in passageways) and it highlights the 3 works of the “JHB ArtCity” and the 12 works of the “Bus Rapid Transport System Artworks”. The database of Luanda includes 11 series of public artworks (7 large-scale sculptures and monuments, 6 artworks in passageways including a series of temporary billboards, and a series of proximity artworks made of “temporary monuments”); related to the specific cultural production in Luanda, the report also includes the description of 8 landmarks and 10 cultural spaces. Among the cultural spaces, the 5 buildings restored by the Luanda Triennale, used for exhibitions and restituted to their owners after the event are also listed. The filing provides for each work or series of works (the artwork can include more objects and interventions) the title, the location, a description of the work and of the artist(s), images and further information about the location and level of significance. Data have been geo-positioned and uploaded on the Harvard World Map, an online open map aggregator (developed initially with a focus on Africa and the arts) and allowing to facilitate research using geo-positioned data, historical and contemporary maps. Around 4’000 images of cultural production in Douala between 1991 and 2013 were uploaded on Wikimedia Commons under the license Creative Commons attribution share-alike thanks to the authorizations of doual’art, photographers and artists.

After providing a panoramic report of Douala, the case studies provide a before and after situation in the two neighborhoods of Bessengue and New Bell at the center of cultural events and public art produced not only by doual’art and the SUD Salon Urbain de Douala but also by other institutions. The two neighborhoods have been at the center of qualitative interviews, a survey of 200 people (100 in New Bell and 100 in Bessengue). A mobile phone number was set up in Cameroon to test the applicability of Ushahidi to report and map information online; the test on mobile phones produced limited results and showed the infrastructural limits of the current Internet connectivity in Cameroon; we therefore decided not to rely on this tool for the research. These two neighborhoods have been analyzed as case studies since they present an intense production of artworks in a limited

area. Bessengué is the location of the “Atelier Urbain de Bessengué” (2001), “Bessengué city” (2003, with the production of the Radio *Bessengué city*, a community radio; *Bouquet de Souris* (a video project); an *informal house* built at the entrance of the district, made with colored, recycled and resistant materials; a *chat website* linking two Cameroonian women, one living in Bessengué and the other one in Indonesia; and the *Hope box*, collecting local communities’ thoughts and proposals for the district improvement), the workshop *Cadavre exquis* (2003) resulting in a triptych wall painting at the boundary between the neighborhoods of Bessengué and Akwa Nord, the Borne Fontaine by Danielle Diwota-Kotto (2003), the Passerelle de Bessengué with an intervention of Alioum Moussa (2005) and more recently – within the SUD Salon Urbain de Douala 2013 – the projects *Bessengué B’Etoukoa* by Trinity Session - Stephen Hobbs and Marcus Neustetter, *Madiba Square* by Pascale Marthine Tayou, *Têtes de rêve* by Boris Nzebo and *Light intervention* by Raumlabor. Semi-structured interviews were addressed to Marilyn Douala Bell and Didier Schaub, president and artistic director of doual’art, the public art funding agency; Ndoumbe Ebenezer, president of the Communauté Développement Bessengué-Akwa (CDBA); Ginette Daleu, visual artist who did several projects in Bessengué in 2002 and 2003; Simon de Gaulle, inhabitant and tourist guide of Bessengué; Thomas, the hair stylist working on the square between the two proximity artworks selected as case studies: *La Passerelle* and *La Borne-Fontaine*; and the *Fontanier*, taking care of the functioning and maintenance of the *Borne-Fontaine*. New Bell is the location of two large-scale monumental installations (the *Njé Mo Yé* by Koko Komengé, a five-meter-high sculpture made of red painted steel tubes of 12 cm diameter conceptualizing the Cameroonian family positioned at the crossroad “Dernier Poteau”; and the *Colonne Pascal* by Marthine Tayou, a twelve-meter-high totem made of enamel pots superimposed located in the middle of Shell New Bell roundabout); a proximity artwork (the *New Walk Ways* by Kamiel Verschuren) and two passageways artworks (*Oasis* by Tracey Rose, a mural installation located inside the walls of the CBC Babylon School, and *Les Mots Écrits de New Bell* by Hervé Yamguen, a series of six mural installations dislocated around the neighborhood of New Bell Ngangue) produced by doual’art within the frame of the cultural event SUD Salon Urbain de Douala. New Bell was also the location of the cultural space K-FACTORY and the event *Scénographie Urbaine* (“Urban scenography”). Semi-structured interviews were addressed to Hervé Yamguen, Picsou, and Moctomoflar, the artist and musicians of the installation *Les Mots Écrits de New Bell*; the director and a teacher of the CBC Babylon School, whose façade hosts *Les Mots Écrits de New Bell*; and Kakanu, the owner of the bar hosting a piece of the same series of installations; the traditional chief of the block number 5 of New Bell, supervising the areas of New Bell Ngangue and Babylon; Marilyn Douala Bell and Didier Schaub, president and director of doual’art, the public art funding agency; Jean Yango, director of the Urban Planning and Development Department of the City Council of Douala (CUD); Junior Ndalle, journalist of Douala; and Adrien Kouomou Monting, inhabitant and part-time journalist from New Bell.

Beyond the panoramic report of Johannesburg, three case studies document and analyze three artworks in depth: *Troyeville Bedtime Stories*, *Oppenheimer Park* and *Diespsloot I Love You*. The three works have been selected to provide a variety of case studies from different neighborhoods (suburb with low density, inner-city with high density and township with high density), different locations (two parks and a residential area), different types of commissioning (private and public by the JDA Johannesburg Development Agency), different objectives (private initiative to improve a park for the community and city upgrading and urban regeneration) and different processes (private initiative, local government initiative without and with community participation). The case studies have been documented by collecting the facts about each work and through observation (direct observation and observation through time using Google images from 2001 or 2004 to 2013), interviews and reflexive analysis. Interviews included one-on-one and small group interviews with community members in and around the public art space. The semi-structured interview questions focused on actual use or avoidance of the space (current and prior to the installation of the artwork

when relevant); attitudes and perspectives towards the artwork; levels of engagement with the work. This was collected in both written and video (Vox Pop) formats.

In the case of Luanda, the focus was on the urban scale. A specific emphasis was posit on the city urban development through time, and its political implications. The UNAP and in particular the Luanda Triennale – and their relationship with the city – have been highlighted as a case study. The research was conducted through field research, observation, 56 qualitative interviews, the reading of historical maps from which it was possible to unfold the urban stratification and some of the main spatial issues linked to the city construction (Arquivo Historico Ultramarino Lisboa, Archive IPAD - Instituto de Apoio ao Desenvolvimento Lisbon, Documentação AHU > 03-MU 1911-75 > DGOPC, Archive of the Luanda Triennial) and the production and review of photos.

### **2.3 Actors: role, intentions, contribution**

The actors involved in commissioning public art have been interviewed. The case studies focused on a broader number of actors including artists, local authorities, communities involved and a section of the audience. In the case of Douala a limited survey of 200 people with 51 closed and open questions was produced to collect information about the interviewees' profile, mobile phone usage and communication, knowledge and perception of public art, impact of public art on security and life style and requests for improvement in terms of security in the two specific neighborhoods of Bessengué and New Bell.

### **2.4 The impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety: before and after**

To collect evidence of the impact of cultural events on public art, the team researched the situation before and after cultural events and public art. The focus on before and after addressed the case studies selected in each city. An overview of the cities through time (highlighting safety and security issues and the production of cultural events and public art) is presented in the panoramic reports and is based on literature reviews, official documents, statistics, cultural policies and qualitative interviews with a series of key stakeholders.

A series of repeated criticism has been raised towards the evaluation of art. It is suggested that it is unrealistic that short-term projects can have an impact on issues related to health, crime, education, employment (DCMS, 1999); evidences collected are often considered anecdotal because they report the personal points of view of participants (DCMS, 1999; Belfiore, 2006); the need for measurements and longitudinal studies is consistently mentioned (DCMS, 1999; Coalter, 2001) and in any case there are doubts about the possibility of providing 'cause-effect' relationships (Matarasso, 1996; Jermyn, 2001; Reever, 2002). To collect the most relevant data, our research emphasizes the physical transformations of sites. The research timeframe was 1991-2013. For the research in Johannesburg it was possible to use Google images to observe the site through time before and after 2010; it was also possible to frame the works within the JDA Johannesburg Development Agency regeneration and upgrade plans. To explore in particular the impact of the Luanda Triennial on Luanda (assuming the triennial is a public artwork with an urban scale), the urban transformations of the city were documented and studied using archive materials and observation. The 4'000 images collected on the cultural production of Douala and uploaded on Wikimedia Commons allowed to retrace the transformations of the sites in particular in the neighborhoods of Bessengué and New Bell, where cultural productions have started in 2001 and 2002. Interviews were used to record impressions of how the sites changed and information collected through interviews were confronted with observations and images.

## **3. Research results**

### **3.1 Actors: role, intentions, contribution**

The production of cultural events and public art in the three cities at the center of our research involves a series of actors: governmental organizations, non governmental institutions and informal



groups, artists and communities which are engaged and addressed and which attend cultural events, view the artworks and eventually benefit from these artworks.

A public agency is a major actor in the production of public art in Johannesburg: since 2001 the JDA Johannesburg Development Agency has commissioned most of the artworks in the city, framed within urban development and regeneration plans which include resettlements. Public art has been consciously deployed as a strategy for creating meaningful and safe public spaces as part of the overall regeneration of the complex and challenging environment of Inner City Johannesburg. From the interviews, though, what emerges is that – in the intention of the JDA – safety is essentially associated to the safety of the artworks and the safety of the people accessing and enjoying the artworks. There is no direct intentionality of producing safety by commissioning artworks; the artworks have mainly a commemorative aim (strongly associated to the reconstruction of new histories and narratives) and they tend to represent the last component of the urban regeneration process with limited involvement of artists in the actual regeneration plans (with some notable exceptions such as the Faraday Place in 2003). As emerges in the case study of the Oppenheimer Park, fences, gates and guards are used to protect the area and the artworks. New attempts to engage communities have started more recently. The case study of the *Diespsloot I Love You* documents one of these projects and highlights the interest in testing the capacity of artistic practices to activate and reinforce communities. In the case study of *Troyeville Bedtime Stories*, the fact that the production of a public artwork in a park was produced by an independent group without formal authorizations was recalled as a key element in the success of the project, perceived as community-lead and independent from the government, and capable of triggering respect and maintenance of the work; in the case of *Troyeville Bedtime Stories* the park and the artwork are not protected by fences, gates and guards.

In the case of Douala, the productions at the centre of our research are conceived and implemented by a key non-governmental institution: doual'art. The institution “offers the artworks to the city” (as declared by the organizers and formally stated in agreements with the city government). Regardless of the actual producers, what emerges from the survey and the interviews is that large-scale sculptures produced by the NGO in particular are attributed to the government; in the case of artworks with an infrastructural-functional component the attribution is commonly associated to the government or development organizations (unless the people interviewed have been actively engaged in the production). The aim of doual'art is to contribute to transform the city of Douala, its identity and the way people perceive themselves in the city and in the world. Producing a safer city is not in the intentions and vision of doual'art, but it has been at the center of its work. In 2003 in the neighborhood Bessengué, doual'art produced a small building with access to water and a bridge (both interventions conceived with the participation of artists); the works emerge from discussions with the community (which highlighted the need for these two infrastructures for safety reasons). The discussions were organized for the actual need of establishing an agreement with the community to organize events and to install artworks on their land; this led to the necessity of creating an informal community group; later on this informal community group archived – with the support of doual'art – the result of obtaining new funds for the development of the neighborhood; Bessengué will receive funds from the World Bank; the presence of an organized community in the neighborhood plays a central role in being selected as a pilot project. doual'art has exchanged with the local government for the necessity of obtaining authorizations for events and the installation of large-scale sculptures on public land (in particular roundabouts); the organization has been seeking a stronger partnership since 2007, to access data and maps on the city but also to reinforce its capacity of intervening on the city. The art productions for the SUD Salon Urbain de Douala 2010 focused on the issue of water, a main resource and threat in the city of Douala and for the SUD 2013 doual'art wanted to support specifically artworks including architectural and functional elements.

In Luanda the concept of contributing to conflict resolution with culture is strongly related to the vision and practice of an artist: Fernando Alvim. Alvim is the director of the Luanda Triennale, an

event promoted by the Ministry of Culture but specifically conceived by him. The discourse and vision of the event is specifically relevant for the research topic because it addressed the post-war conditions of the city of Luanda directly and it shows – compared to the discourse around cultural events and public art in Douala and Johannesburg – a direct interest in the role of culture in reducing conflicts and in contributing in the transition process of Angola from a militaristic society to a civil society. Of course the cease-fire of 2002 after 30 years of civil war is specific to Angola, but there is a peculiar strength in the position of Fernando Alvim, echoed in the words of Simon Njami – a major international art curator collaborating with Alvim and the Luanda Triennale – and in the words of the collector Sindika Dokolo – supporter of the Luanda Triennale and of the Sindika Dokolo Foundation organizing it – who claim that the arts should be used as a weapon. This strength generates a very peculiar discourse, which links the vision of Fernando Alvim and the Luanda Triennial to the cultural vision of independence movements. The arts are conceived as a revolutionary and political tool and the tone takes a clear distance from the more commonly used discourses – in Africa and in the arts – related to development and regeneration. The research highlighted the distance between the discourse and vision, and the actual implementation of the triennial. Even if promoted by the Ministry of Culture and supported by Sindika Dokolo – a wealthy Congolese art collector who is married to the daughter of the President of Angola, Isabel dos Santos – at the moment the triennial does not appear to have influenced a broader cultural program, a sensitivity to the preservation of cultural heritage and larger urban plans. During the triennial some abandoned buildings were restored in order to be used during the event and the vision of Fernando Alvim appears to have triggered – at an international level and in the specific field of contemporary art – interest on him and Luanda.

Another important element that merits to be highlighted is the artists' choice of producing artworks, which directly address practical problems. In the process that the NGO doual'art applies to produce public art in Douala, artists have great freedom in selecting the specific site where they want to intervene. The documentation about the artworks produced shows that a series of artists have deliberately (and independently) decided to create artworks with an infrastructural-functional nature: it is the case of the artworks produced by Kamiel Verschuren, Lucas Grandin, Tracey Rose, Loris Cecchini, Jesus Palomino, Philip Aguirre, Ties Ten Bosch, James Becket (for the SUD Salon Urbain Douala 2013, doual'art explicitly aimed at producing artworks with an architectural – infrastructural-functional – nature by involving Raumlabor, Pascale Marthine Tayou for Madiba square and Juan Fernando Herran). What emerges by looking at the artists deliberately (and independently) producing infrastructural-functional artworks is that none of them live in Douala and that this infrastructural-functional element can either be a constant element of their practice or a new element introduced for the site-specific work in Douala. The intentionality and the direct link with safety is self-explanatory in the wooden planks covering open gutters by Kamiel Verschuren, the shelter by Jesus Palomino, the bridge by Ties Ten Bosch, the well of Loris Cecchini and – in the case of Philip Aguirre – a theatre which redesigns the space around a water source and includes the water system. The works *Le Jardin sonore* [the sound garden] of Lucas Grandin and *Oasis* of Tracey Rose are more complex and particularly relevant examples of artworks which on one side relate to an infrastructural-functional component and on the other side provide a relevant example of the space of research and experimentation our hypothesis refers to; both works present a strong coherence with the artists' practice, but the approach is declined in a new way in Douala. It shows both the deliberate (and independent) interest of the artists in addressing the audience and its "needs", and the capacity of the work to maintain a central aesthetic and evocative strength. The needs addressed by the artists are both practical (producing a shared space by cleaning and refreshing an area) and immaterial (producing a space for the imagination). In the case of *Oasis*, the artist Tracey Rose embellished a school with murals (which can be defined a very well-know and widely used technique and type of public art), but what is specific of this work is that the images created – even if they are framed in the title *Oasis* and portrait flowers, animals and names of plants – are actually scary. The animals and the flowers are disproportionate, and the names of plants

recall the classification systems, which has produced a specific legacy in Africa. The strength of this work relies on the contradiction between beautifying and producing a safer space, and at the same time evoking to the innocents – the little primary school children – that the world is actually an unsafe place.

The direct and indirect fruition and perception of the artworks involves the largest group of actors: communities. Communities are engaged, addressed or they are simply the beneficiaries and viewers of the artworks. It is obvious that the production of art in the public realm is specifically aimed at reaching a larger public, but the relationship with it can vary widely, according to the production process employed. In the cities at the center of our research it appears that safety is a concern constantly in the background. When addressed during the production of artworks in the neighborhood of Bessengué in Douala, the community immediately requested interventions focused on safety and security: a bridge to secure the access to the neighborhood, access to clean water, streets to allow ambulances and firefighters to rush, interventions to limit the damages of flows during the rainy season and of course basic services such as electricity, sanitation and collection of garbage to reduce the insalubrity of their living conditions. The research has highlighted how the reaction and the feedback from communities vary greatly according to a series of characteristics of the artwork and their location. One of the most interesting aspect of the relationship between culture and safety which has emerged is certainly the capacity of some artworks to trigger images, emotional geographies (an expression used by Fernando Alvim) and reactions: something which can be summarized in the sentence “Ça réveille” [it wakes you up] – stated by a teacher of the school CBC Babylon of New Bell in Douala. It is then – in finding something in the artwork, but also in the confrontation and exchange with artists and people who sabotage consolidated paths and power dynamics – that something new happens: people start caring about places and other people (maintenance of the areas, engagement, establishment of groups and renovations; when asked people affirm that places are safer now). Those artworks appear to participate in the construction and production of value, in particular in places where people feel there is no value. Only few artworks appear to have this effect. In other cases their presence is not noticed or it is vaguely associated to a sense of well-being. Monuments and large-scale sculptures appear to produce much more conflictual reactions; regardless of who has produced them; they are perceived as public statements, and media coverage tends to empathized disputes and political issues.

### **3.2 The impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety: before and after**

The research in the three cities of Douala, Luanda and Johannesburg has reported a series of facts describing the situation before and after the production of cultural events and public art. We present below a selection and short summary of the information collected in the reports and case studies.

1. In the neighborhood of Bessengué in Douala, in the Nineties there was no access to water, sanitation, electricity and garbage collection and there were regular flows. In 2001 a first artistic workshop is organized (producing murals and street signs), in 2003 there is a second workshop (producing also artworks in the form of a shelter and a radio station), the production of a tryptic murals and the installment of *Borne Fontaine*; in 2005 *La Passerelle* is installed, a bridge which connects the neighborhood to the main road accessible only through unstable wooden planks before. To intervene in the neighborhood the NGO doual'art triggered the institution of an informal group which is currently the Development Committee of Bessengué-Akwa (Communauté de Développement de Bessengué-Akwa – CDBA) and which has later on lead to the selection of Bessengué as pilot project for new development interventions supported by the World Bank (two more water pumps installed, the lanes of the valley paved, and a wide dirt patch created along the Mbopi River, allowing ambulances and firemen to access the district in case of emergency). The risk of floods has strongly decreased since the CDBA succeeded in prompting the Urban Community of Douala to drain the bed of the Mbopi River every two years; a bin has been located just out of the district and the agency in charge of this service empties it every day. At the same

time, a non-native chief managing the enclosed block between the area of the Passerelle, the Bornefontaine and a third block facing a major boulevard, has been inspired to fundraise money and to lead to the installation of electricity in his area and in 2013 the construction of a new bridge, made of concrete, over the Mbopi river. The location of the *Borne Fontaine* (managed by the CDBA, which reinvests its revenue in interventions of maintenance) and *La Passerelle* has become a new shared space, used as a meeting point and a playground for children. New informal businesses have been installed around this space, but their location on the borders of the Mbopi River is at risk of floods during the rainy season. In 2013 a new series of artworks was produced by doual'art in the neighborhood of Bessengué in the frame of the SUD Salon Urbain de Douala. Out of 100 people responding to the survey 98% declare that they are proud of the presence of the installations and 69% assert that aggressions have diminished.

2. New Bell is a district of Douala stigmatized by a bad reputation due to the poor living conditions of its inhabitants, diffused criminality, and the fact that it hosts the central jail of Douala, one of the worst of Cameroon (Amnesty international, 2008). Gutters and watercourses are open, running all along the main paved roads and used as garbage dumps. A code of silence of the community protects criminals from the police and aggressions are reported in particular at night (CUD, 2004). The district is the location of the art group Cercle Kapsiki founded in 1998 and involving the artist Hervé Yamguen who lives in New Bell; in 2001-2002 this group has organized the *Scénographie Urbaine*, it opened the centre K-FACTORY (currently temporarily closed) and organized exhibitions. In 2007 the large-scale sculpture *Njé Mo Yé* by Koko Komegné and the neon signs *Néons d'amour* by Hervé Yamguen were produced and in 2010 another series of artworks was installed in the frame of the SUD Salon Urban de Douala. The artwork *New Walk Ways* by Kamiel Verschuren produced a 500-meter-long installation made of wooden planks covering open gutters of the district, featuring perforated text fragments. The work focused on glitters located in the streets and in front of houses, which do not relate closely to specific private houses. In 2012 some of the wooden planks made by Kamiel Verschuren were still there and some others were substituted by the dwellers on their personal initiative. The school CBC Babylon is the location of the murals *Oasis* by Tracey Rose produced in 2010; at the end of 2013 the number of students has increased from 57 to 400 and of teachers from 4 to 14; a new wooden building has been constructed to host an Anglophone section with 6 classes; the director of the school has planted flowers in the school yard in front of the artwork and signage was added to encourage people to avoid throwing garbage on the ground; according to the teachers and director, the presence of murals had a direct impact on the reputation of the school by providing the institution with an image of cleanliness, modernity, and seriousness. The outside of the school is also one of the sites of the murals *Les Mots Écrits de New Bell* by Hervé Yamguen, which intervened on four other walls of the neighborhood by producing artworks around sentences written by a group of young musicians involved in the project. Dwellers have started to paint the wall of their houses reproducing the blue colors of some installations or imitating the drawing of the façade of Hervé Yamguen's house. Specifically in New Bell Ngangué (the area of these works) more than half of the interviewees (52%) correctly attributes the artworks to Hervé Yamguen, and their presence is described by 100% as accepted and appreciated: "they make the neighborhood shine". Always in 2010 also the large-scale sculpture *Colonne Pascal* by Pascale Martin Tayou was installed in New Bell, specifically in the area of Shell New Bell. From the survey and qualitative interview this large-scale sculpture appears to have raised a public debate and it was criticized for not corresponding to the message people wanted the monument to express in the middle of a square testimony of the riots of May 1955. Almost all the people interviewed (96%) perceive Shell New Bell as a safe landmark for motorbike and taxi transfer, but even for dating partners, meeting friends, having lunch or enjoying a beer. Moreover, 88% of the interviewees assert that after the installment of the monument the place has become cleaner, that criminality around there has diminished (88%), and the presence of tourists has increased (66%); 78% of the people interviewed believes that tourists are rather safe going there to spend time.

3. The renovation of the Oppenheimer Park in Johannesburg was associated with the 2010 production of a series of five sculptures, a public commission of the JDA Johannesburg Development Agency. Before the restoration, the park was home to a motley crew of homeless people and trolley pushers – recyclers who used the park as a parking lot for their trolleys. In 1999 the area was identified by the city as a priority for upgrade but the process was complicated because the city had to contend with where to house hundreds of informal traders who actually paid (an entrepreneur and self appointed park manager) to use the park as storage for their wares. The park is now surrounded by a fence and a guard opens the gates every morning at 7am and closes it at 7pm. Inevitably the strict access regime and full-time security means that the park is safe and this impacts upon people's perceptions of their own safety. With the exception of young, mostly male basketball players for whom the park is a destination, most of the Oppenheimer Park users are transitory, using the park as a rest stop or meeting point on their way elsewhere. Statistical evidence of crimes shows how crime has shifted broadly in the city over a ten-year period; one can hardly provide statistical evidence for specific precincts like the Oppenheimer Park. Despite the lack of concrete data, there is qualitative evidence that the Ernest Oppenheimer Park is safer now than it was before its rehabilitation in 2010. In the interviews, there are certain visual cues that respondents associated with safety in the park – flowers, an environment that is well kept and clean, the presence of other people enjoying the park, and so on. Whether conscious or not, there seems to be an association between a sense of wellbeing (which includes safety) and the nature of the environment. Men and women, young and old, used environmental registers of beauty and cleanliness to relay their sense of comfort, relaxation and safety in their park. Even though people seemingly did not notice the art or understand its meaning, there was an overwhelming response that it was an important feature of the park.

4. In the case of *Troyeville Bedtime Stories* by Johannes Dreyer, a sculpture in the shape of a bed has been located in 2010 in a park in the neighborhood of Troyeville in Johannesburg. The park has no fences, gates and guards and it is maintained by City Parks, and even before the Troyeville bed, City Parks cut the grass, and picked up the garbage in the park; the artist did not seek any permission to install the artwork. The subject of the artwork crosses the line of what is visible and invisible in public space and it raises interesting questions on how and what people see in public. The title in many ways evokes the safety of home and the bedtime rituals of middle class nuclear families. It is as a result of the neglect of the park that the curator Lesley Perkes decided to invest in a sculpture. "There was a pile of rubble that was unsafe and unhealthy. It was not safe for children to go and play in the park". In the interviews with park users around the safety of the Troyeville park, respondents referenced proxies like the park's cleanliness, the number of users, the trees, benches and the general feeling of the environment as ways of explaining why they felt safe in the park "since this bed was here, I could walk there". It is not the art piece that gives a sense of safety and security, but its presence appears to trigger activities that improve the sense of safety and security in the environment. The sculpture had ripple effects on City Parks' investment in the park. According to community members and park users, City Parks installed more benches and dustbins in the area *after* the sculpture was built. Furthermore the production of the work triggered relationships and involved people in taking responsibility for it and taking care of its maintenance. The Troyeville Bedtime Story achieved what many would regard as impossible in Johannesburg. In a city where socializing with 'strangers' in a public park at night with no controlled security or walls is unheard of, having families out in their pajamas tested the discourses of fear and insecurity that circulate in the city. It demonstrated that it is possible to feel safe in an inner-city park without private security. Yet these spaces of safety are ephemeral and come together with great effort from community members. To a large extent, the presence of a stable community appears to have been part of the project's success.

5. In 2011-2012 the performance and sculpture *Diepsloot I love you* was produced in the neighborhood of Diepsloot West in Johannesburg, one of the most economically marginal areas in the city. Infamous for its violence, Diepsloot is a post-apartheid's problem child, with the confluence of South Africa's post-independence challenges – poverty, immigration, service provision, unemployment, housing, infrastructure and crime; in May 2008 it was the centre of xenophobic violence that spread across South Africa. In 2013-2014 the neighborhood has been at the center of a rehabilitation investment. “Diepsloot”, as the city's brochure states “is ready for development”. While the publicly available statistics are useful in putting crime in Diepsloot in broader perspective, they are unable to tell us where the crime happens within the township. It is difficult, for example, to obtain local level statistics that tell us whether crime in the area around Muzomuhle primary school in Extension 2 has changed as a result of the public art intervention. Indeed even in Diepsloot, levels of safety differ between sections. The residents we interviewed clearly pointed out the areas that were most notorious for crime. Extension 2, where we conducted our research is considered safer than Extension 1. But numbers often hide the socio-psychological impact of crime on an everyday level. It is difficult to have a conversation in Diepsloot without talking about crime. For the community, participating in the project had a deep significance, it symbolized the community's “voice” (their ability to comprehend, interpret and articulate their own stories in ways that assert their experiences and a vehicle for social dialogue) and the potential empowerment of the community to make decisions about their environment. If public art alone cannot address issues of public safety and crime, there is a sense in Diepsloot that *some* behavior has changed due to the artwork. Previously, the owner only cleaned the area immediately outside of his tavern and left the garbage beyond this perimeter on the streets. When the DACN members were cleaning the bridge one day, the Tavern owner said to them “*you are already doing the art, I will clean out here*”. The art has given people in this part of Diepsloot a sense of responsibility for their spaces. A resident states that “*art makes it safer for kids to play and relax... It's safe because it is in the open compared to the paths in the squatter camp. Everyone can see you. If people try to do some harm they can be seen*”. When the sculptures were initially installed, one of the pieces was vandalized and stolen, and there was a fear that this would happen again. The process of repairing the artwork resulted in a tacit agreement of non-aggression and respect towards the space and the work done in it. It appears that it is this unquantifiable process of humanizing people and spaces that plays a powerful role in improving conviviality and wellbeing.

6. The organization of the Luanda Triennale started in 2003 and it had two editions in 2006-2007 and 2010, which produced exhibitions in a series of five renovated buildings. The event is initiated by the Angola government, its concept is designed by the artist Fernando Alvim, it is implemented by the Sindika Dokolo Foundation and promoted by the Ministry of Culture. In 2013 the research documented the vision and discourse of the triennale with interviews to Fernando Alvim and to another key co-organizer Simon Njami; the vision was framed within the political, urban and artistic context of Luanda, by considering the triennial in itself as public artwork at an urban scale. The vision and discourse of the triennale is rooted in the post-war situation of Angola, its militaristic society and the role of culture, art and cultural heritage within Angola history; the concept of the triennial is to be – not an event – but a cultural “movement” capable of triggering mental spaces and emotional geographies through desire, to reconstruct the cultural identity of the country after three decades of civil war. The concept of the triennale refers to repairing and re-establishing “humanity” in the city and it is strongly coherent with Fernando Alvim's artistic practices and previous projects. The triennale organized free events, and recuperated and occupied temporarily vacant spaces (the Globo hotel, the Correios de Angola, Vivenda, the Armazen, the Baleizão). In 2013 the buildings renovated by the triennale are still in use by their specific owners; the event took place in the city center and no events were organized in the Bairros. In 2007 the exhibition Check List Luanda Pop – the so-called African pavilion – was presented as an off event at the Venice Biennale, considered one of the major world contemporary art events; it was selected

by a jury nominated by the biennale artist director and hosted in the Arsenale; in 2010 Fernando Alvim was one of the curator of the São Paulo Biennial; in 2013 the Pavilion of Angola won the golden lion at the Venice Biennale. This short selection of the Angolan presence at international events documents a change in the cultural reputation of the country and a recognition; interviews though did not record an impact of the event in the Luanda physical landscape, nor an impact of the event at the broader political scale by influencing urban planning. After the independence and the war, a small group of public monuments has been commissioned in Luanda by the government; this production of public art is located in the central area in sensitive military spots, and therefore highly secured by military and police force. Differently from this public art production, the field research has highlighted the role of cultural heritage as a fundamental landmark in the city (which is currently threatened by massive demolitions) and the role of different cultural institutions in activating and contributing to Luanda’s cultural life; performative arts and music play a specific role in the Bairros to trigger socialization.

### 3.3 Cultural events and public art: Taxonomy

The data collected through the case studies – confronted with cultural events and public art produced in the three cities – lead to attempt a taxonomy which highlights common patterns emerging within the research associated to different kinds of cultural productions: proximity artworks, artworks in passageways, large-scale sculptures and monuments, urban-scale artworks and cultural events. The distinction among the works is based on a proposal of Marilyn Douala Bell, president of doual’art. For brevity we summarize the different typology of artworks in a table.

Taxonomy	Location	Impact
Proximity artworks	Neighborhoods, informal settlements.	<p>Necessity of negotiating the land with the inhabitants. As a preparatory phase, necessity of producing research on the sites, in particular on unmapped informal settlement. More likely to involve the community in the process of defining the location, to address needs and to create a consensus.</p> <p>Often artworks with functionality. The artwork can respond to a specific need related to natural and man-made disasters. The functionality is meant to improve the living conditions and it triggers community-based and individual initiatives. Among examples of individual initiatives: maintenance of the site by the community, use of the site as a shared space, new economic activities (informal trading, small businesses), establishment of groups supporting the production of new development projects. For its specific function it is perceived by the inhabitants mainly as a development project and - even when produced by independent institutions - it is more likely to be perceived as made by the public administration.</p> <p>Artworks located in parks and integrated in a regeneration plan tend to produce similar reactions; the park users do not actually notice the artworks, which are part of the park itself.</p>
Artworks in passageways (sculptures, murals, signs)	Neighborhoods, informal settlements.	<p>Necessity of negotiating the land with the inhabitants. Limited or no functionality. Since it doesn’t have a specific function it is more likely to be acknowledged as an artwork, and it brings people to</p>

		<p>discuss about value and beauty and to emulate them. Among examples of emulations: maintenance and improvement of the surrounding areas, use of the same color pattern of the artwork by the inhabitants, references to the esthetics of the artwork, the feedback of the community is not about the functionality of the work but about their personal interpretation and the value of the work.</p> <p>Through contemporary art production, cultural heritage can be highlighted by using signs or by including it in more conceptual urban interventions; this process of re-appropriation generates new meanings.</p>
Large-scale sculptures and monuments	Roundabouts and squares (government land)	<p>Limited or no functionality.</p> <p>Necessity of negotiating the land with the government if the artwork is not produced by the government.</p> <p>The artwork is likely to be perceived as a public statement. The size of the work tends to bring the discussion in particular on local media. The feedback of the work can be conflictual.</p> <p>The production can be associated to a regeneration plan; it can be directly commissioned by the government.</p> <p>If conceived in a large regeneration plan, it can be associated to evictions. In the other cases it includes evictions in particular of informal traders or their relocation.</p> <p>More likely to be vandalized as a political statement.</p> <p>Role as landmarks.</p>
Urban-scale artworks and cultural events	Conceived to be focused on the entire city	<p>Negotiation on specific locations. These negotiations can include public and private buildings.</p> <p>The use of sites can produce permanent restorations and repurpose of buildings with middle and long-term impact on the urban development.</p> <p>It requires the involvement of many stakeholders. The government needs to be involved (this necessity opens a discussion with the government which can lead to include the arts in policies and broader strategies).</p> <p>International communication and visibility of the production.</p>

## 4. Discussion

### 4.1 Urban safety

A monument located in a sensitive military spot highly secured by military and police force has no role in triggering unforeseen ways of producing higher livability, civil cohabitation and social cohesion. To quote people interviewed, it is not the artwork in itself that provides a sense of safety because *“it would be safer if it was fenced with security people dedicated to looking after your safety”*. Relocations of homeless people and informal traders, urban regeneration, fences, gates and guards do accompany the production of cultural events and public art, they do certainly secure areas, but they are not what this research was looking for.



This research was looking for a space for experimentation and research, not directly connected to urban safety, but capable of triggering unforeseen ways of producing higher livability, civil cohabitation and social cohesion. Its focus was on the arts and their capacity of instilling a change, which can produce a safer environment or an environment perceived as safer.

In the contexts at the center of our research, crime – and the fear of crime – is a register that directs how people plan their everyday activities; threats determine what urban safety represents for dwellers, and it includes not only crime and violence but also car and traffic accidents, lack of freedom of expression, the fall-outs of corruption, the damages of regular flows, the lack of basic services, sicknesses, and the risk of forced evictions. Side by side with gated neighborhoods, guards and urban regeneration plan – in the three cities of Douala in Cameroon, Johannesburg in South Africa and Luanda in Angola poverty, abandon, criminality and violence, forced evictions, human and natural disasters (UN-Habitat, 2007) are a determinant presence in the life of the inhabitants. The very concept of “public space” is often associated with risks and its meaning is perceived as “governmental/owned by the government” rather than “shared”; in the interviews, people can recall streets and squares which have being battlefields, areas of curfews and places of aggression. Even if people invoke the presence of the police, they do not necessarily have confidence in them; crimes are not always denounced, domestic violence and rape are under-reported statistics, and in Luanda several people interviewed asked to remain anonymous. Armed gangs (bandits – as they are called) are a constant threat in Douala and the news report regularly cases of rough justice in the neighborhoods executed by setting fire to the arbitrarily judged criminals. Safety is an indicator of the quality of life (Legowski, 2000; Esteves et al, 2012) and it appears to have a central role in the contexts at the center of our research.

#### **4.2 The impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety: direct and indirect effects**

We discuss below the research results by dividing the impact on urban safety into direct and indirect; the direct impact is a primary consequence or benefit; the indirect impact is a secondary consequence or benefit – as defined for art in the report ‘Developing Methodologies for Public Art Evaluation’ (Bower et al, 2012).

##### **4.2.1 Direct impact**

The artistic objects can indeed directly produce safety. Artworks produced in densely populated areas with infrastructural-functional elements produced a safer environment, reducing natural and human made disasters. It is their functionality at the center of people’s attention and its capacity of solving a problem. Artworks with those characteristics were produced in Douala and they contributed directly to create safer access to neighborhoods with the construction of bridges, to provide clean water and wooden planks covering open gutters. It is necessary to mention that the capacity of artists of producing infrastructural-functional elements and the maintenance of those infrastructural-functional elements can indeed be a risk; the respect of norms and the rapid deterioration of materials in particular in tropical climate do not assure that those works are or remain safe and they can constitute a danger.

Making space. An impact, which appears to be direct – and particularly relevant – is the capacity of public art of creating a shared space. In the case of urban upgrades and regeneration plans, the artwork can be an element of the process and it can add a sense of well-being by showing that the site is clean, maintained and cared for (which in several interviews appears to be associated to the consideration that a site is safe); in those cases a shared space was produced but it was not created by the artwork. It is very different when it is the artwork in itself, which creates or starts the process of creating a shared space; in those cases it is the artworks, which directly contributes in “making space” and providing a new image of an area. Those interventions require a negotiation for the land and in the case of Douala they always start with cleaning. Maintenance becomes a central aspect; the willingness and capacity of the inhabitants to take care of the space appears to be an important element to evaluate the success of the intervention, in a way that recalls the “broken windows”

theory (Wilson and Kelling 1982). The capacity of producing shared space can emerge also by pointing out cultural heritage; and cultural events do also have the capacity of contributing in building shared spaces (i.e. Scénographies Urbaines in Douala). The capacity of generating a shared space appears differently in large-scale sculptures and monuments positioned in squares and roundabouts; those productions are rather perceived as a public statement, regardless of whom has produced them; they can attract new business and be used as a landmark, but their relationship with the communities tend to remain conflictual.

Conflicts. Large-scale sculptures and monuments positioned in squares and roundabouts appear to be likely to produce media coverage and conflictual reactions. Regardless of who has produced them, those productions are perceived as public statements. In the case of *La Nouvelle Liberté* in Douala the discussion about the sculpture even caused a physical threat to doual'art, the NGO commissioning and producing it. On the other hand, public discussions can also provide a platform for freedom of expression in context where is not necessary easy to speak of political and social issues. It is important to mention though that it is not necessarily the artwork to address conflictual issues; in general the subjects of the public art we reviewed tend to be politically correct and the conflicts come from interpretations of the works or they appear to use the artwork as a chance to address broader public issues (the use of public investments – even when the works are not produced with public fund – and historical, social, ethnic and political references).

Urban branding. Public art do contribute to the image and rebranding of cities but their impact appears to be limited. In the cases of Luanda, Johannesburg and Douala – known for their high criminality and definitely not established touristic destinations – all the production we observed had an international visibility with articles and presentations and they attracted to the cities new visitors. Nevertheless the impact is limited to a niche and it does not appear between 1991 and 2013 to have leveraged a determinant shift.

#### 4.2.2 Indirect impact

*“Je sens que le quartier n'est pas complètement abandonné”  
(I feel the neighborhood is not completely abandoned)*

According to our case studies, the process of producing cultural events and public art can have an indirect impact on urban safety by changing behavior, by triggering relationships, ownership, humanity, empowerment and active citizenship. It is the process, the construction of value and the sense of pride, which appear to have a determinant role.

In informal settlements, the production of culture can be an entrance point. The specific making of art does not make a neighborhood without basic services into a safe and equipped neighborhood, but it can start a process. This process can be the deliberate choice of involving communities or the necessity of involving communities to obtain their authorization and support. This second aspect is particularly interesting because it appears to create a correlation between land ownership and the approach of art production; in case of a government producing artworks on government land, no authorization is needed; but when an NGO or an independent group want to produce cultural events and public art in particular in an informal settlements, the involvement of the communities becomes a necessity to guarantee the artworks can remain and the community will not oppose them.

*“Ça reveille”  
(It wakes you up)*

What characterizes art is its esthetic and evocative power. Art is not meant to produce urban safety, but in the cases it does trigger it, its esthetic and evocative power need to play a role. In the evaluation of cultural events and public art the intrinsic value of the artwork is one of the criteria, but it is evaluated independently from other criteria (ixia, 2010; Bower et al, 2012).

In exploring the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety, the intrinsic value of the artwork tend to play a limited role. By exploring which works appear to produce the most efficient transformations and the greatest impact on urban safety, we indeed target more consistently the fallouts to the detriment of the artwork in itself, even if it can be argued that the cultural events and public art explored in this research are actually pre-selected within a curatorial frame.

The interviews refer to “pride” and to the capacity of the artwork to contribute to the sense of well-being by showing that the site is clean, maintained and cared for; in those cases the artistic quality of the work is irrelevant; it is only its recognized artistic value to play a role which is assumed by the fact that the artwork is located in public view as a monument/artwork, or by the fact that people recognize the author as an artist. In reality the same pride and sense of well-being is expressed for works which are not acknowledged as artworks; people though recognize that that “that specific bridge or fountain” is different from the others and better.

Only in few interviews the intrinsic value of the artworks was mentioned by the interviewed. “Ça réveille” (It wakes you up) is the most interesting comment (associated to the work *Oasis* by Tracey Rose in New Bell in Douala, and somehow similar to the comments collected in Johannesburg referring to the work *Troyeville Bedtime Stories* by Johannes Dreyer). Those comments seem to show that those specific artworks had a stronger capacity than others to establish a personal relationship with the viewer.

#### **4.3 Actors: intentions vs. reality**

The evaluation of public art has been at the center of research associated to institutions promoting and supporting it. The existence of publicly funded art programs produce the necessity of evaluating the productions and justify the investments (Zuidervaart, 2010). One of the most structured research work focused on providing a methodology for evaluation is “Public Art: A Guide to Evaluation” (ixia 2010, third edition 2013). This guide identifies a series of values (artistic, social, environmental and economic values) and among the “social values” it includes also “crime and safety”. This publication is funded by the Arts Council England and a review by the Americans for the Arts argues that it “directs users to [UK-based] government performance indicators as a baseline source” (cited in Gressel, 2012). In a similar way the “theory of change” – applied by grant makers or suggested to grant makers – proposes to evaluate the outcomes of a funded project according to its envisioned plan and effects.

Our research moves away from this approach for two reasons. The first reason is related to the fact that urban safety is not included in the envisioned plan and effects, and it is not an expected result of the events and public art produced in the cities at the center of our analysis. Urban safety relates to urban regeneration, transforming a city and reducing conflicts in a post-war city – the three general aims of the major institutions producing cultural events and public art in Johannesburg, Douala and Luanda – but it remains outside the frame of a direct intentionality.

The second reason is related to the source of funds. If in Johannesburg the publicly funded art program produces the necessity of evaluating the productions and justify the investments, in the case of Douala and Luanda there is no publicly funded art program to solicit and defend. The Luanda Triennial is linked to a private collector and it has explicitly addressed local sponsors openly stating its aim of maintaining an independency from international grant-makers; in the case of Douala the organization doual’art has developed its own public art program, by soliciting international grant-makers, private sponsors and establishing links with the city council.

By observing the actors involved in the production of cultural events and public art in the three cities at the center of our research it emerges a strong difference in the way governmental organizations and non-governmental institutions and informal groups operate. The production of public art within urban regeneration plans – and issues related to land ownership of where the artwork is meant to be located – appear to have a specific impact on the process applied and on the effects. We also highlighted the artists’ choice of producing artworks, which directly address

practical problems. In all those cases the intention is not to produce urban safety; art is not meant for it and it is never a direct intention of the institutions and group commissioning it.

The intentions of the institutions and groups commissioning the works appear to be framed within much broader aims: urban regeneration, urban transformation and re-establish “humanity”. Within those aims, art is meant to play different role either central or collateral. It can play the role of entrance point, it can be the last decorative element of an urban upgrade and it can move alongside a vision and a discourse. Furthermore in the case of artists, the actual capacity of the artwork to address practical problems – when envisioned – does not determine the value of the work neither for the artists, nor for the art system.

The difficulty of evaluating cultural events and public art relies indeed on the fact that within the art system cultural productions are not meant to have an impact. In the specific case of our analysis, the evaluation is not based on the correspondence between intentions and reality, but on the capacity of “urban safety” of providing a prism to observe cultural productions from a specific perspective, that we argue it is particularly relevant in the contexts at the center of our research. Consequently, the success or failure of actors in producing urban safety is irrelevant because it is unplanned and in none of the cases it corresponds to a metric of their work.

## 5. References

- Babina, Lucia, and Marilyn Douala Bell. 2008. *Douala in Translation: A View of the City and Its Creative Transformative Potentials*. Episode Publishers.
- Belfiore, Eleonora. 2006. “The Social Impacts of the Arts – Myth or Reality?” In London: Policy Exchange Limited.
- Bower, Jessica, Marissa Cinquanti, Rebecca Fink, Alexandra Holness, Elyssa Jechow, Sara Ryan, Dana Weinstein, Rachel Wilkinson, and Allison Welch. 2012. “Developing Methodologies for Public Art Evaluation”. H.J. Heinz College - Carnegie Mellon University.
- Coalter, F. 2001. “Cultural Services: Realising the Potential, Research Agenda”. Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh.
- Crowe, Timothy D. 2000. *Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design: Applications of Architectural Design and Space Management Concepts*. Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Esteves, Ana Maria, Daniel Franks, and Frank Vanclay. 2012. “Social Impact Assessment: The State of the Art.” *Impact Assessment and Project Appraisal* 30 (1): 34–42.
- Evans, Graeme. 2005. “Measure for Measure: Evaluating the Evidence of Culture’s Contribution to Regeneration.” *Urban Studies* 42 (5-6): 959–83.
- Filipovic, Elena, Marieke van Hal, and Solveig Øvsteø. 2010. *The Biennial Reader*. Bergen, Norway: Bergen Biennial Conference.
- Freschi, Federico. 2007. “Postapartheid Publics and the Politics of Ornament: Nationalism, Identity, and the Rhetoric of Community in the Decorative Program of the New Constitutional Court, Johannesburg.” *Africa Today* 54 (2): 27–49.
- Gressel, Katherine C. 2012. “Public Art and the Challenge of Evaluation.” *Createquity*.
- Guetzkow, Joshua. 2002. “How the Arts Impact Communities.” *Centre for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies*.
- Hanussek, Christian. 2001. “Cameroon: An Emerging Art Scene.” *Nka Journal of Contemporary African Art* 2001 (13-14): 100–105.
- HDA Health Development Agency. 2000. “Art for Health: A Review of Good Practice in Community-Based Arts Projects and Initiatives Which Impact on Health and Well-Being”. HDA London.
- Hope, Tim, and Margaret Shaw, eds. 1988. *Communities and Crime Reduction*. London: H.M.S.O.
- Hughes, Jenny, Andrew Miles, and Angus McLewin. 2006. *Doing the Arts Justice: A Review of Research Literature, Practice and Theory*. Unit for the Arts and Offenders [and] Centre for Applied Theatre Research.
- ixia, ed. 2010. “Public Art: A Guide to Evaluation”. ixia PA Limited.

- Jacobs, Jane. 1961. *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*. Vintage Books.
- Jermyn, Helen. 2001. *The Arts and Social Exclusion: A Review Prepared for the Arts Council of England*. Arts Council of England London.
- Jermyn, Helen, and Arts Council England. 2004. *The Art of Inclusion*. Vol. 35. Arts Council England London.
- Kelling, George L., and James Q. Wilson. 1982. "Broken Windows." *The Atlantic*, March.
- Legowski, Barbara. 2000. *Sampling of Community and Citizen Driven Quality of Life/societal Indicator Projects*. Canadian Policy Research Networks.
- Malaquais, Dominique. 2006. "Une Nouvelle Liberté? Art et Politique Urbaine À Douala (Cameroun)." *Afrique & Histoire* 5 (1): 111–34.
- Marie, Zen, and Jonathan Cane. 2010. "Walking With / Walking alongside / Walking Against?" Unpublished.
- Marschall, Sabine. 2010. "Articulating Cultural Pluralism through Public Art as Heritage in South Africa." *Visual Anthropology* 23 (2): 77–97.
- Matarasso, François. 1997. *Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in the Arts*. Comedia.
- Minty, Zayd. 2006. "Post-Apartheid Public Art in Cape Town: Symbolic Reparations and Public Space." *Urban Studies* 43 (2): 421–40.
- Newman, Oscar. 1972. *Defensible Space; Crime Prevention through Urban Design*. Macmillan.
- Oberhofer, Michaela Alejandra. 2012. "Fashioning African Cities: The Case of Johannesburg, Lagos and Douala." *Streetnotes* 20.
- Reeves, Michelle. 2002. "Measuring the Economic and Social Impact of the Arts: A Review". The Arts Council of England.
- Sacks, Ruth. 2006. "Tropical High Tech: Recent Activities of the Trienal de Luanda." *Artthrob*, no. 101 (January).
- Siedert, Nadine. 2010. "Angola Pop (2005-2007) : La Première Triennale de Luanda." *Festivals et Biennales d'Afrique : Machine Ou Utopie?* Accessed March 16.
- Storr, Robert. 2007. *Where Art Worlds Meet: Multiple Modernities and the Global Salon, La Biennale Di Venezia International Symposium*. 9-12 December 2005, Istituto veneto di scienze, lettere ed arti, Palazzo Cavalli Franchetti, Campo Santo Stefano, Venice: Marsilio.
- Thompson, Nato. 2012. *Living as Form: Socially Engaged Art from 1991-2011*. MIT Press (MA).
- UN-Habitat. 2007. *Enhancing Urban Safety and Security: Global Report on Human Settlements 2007*. UN-Habitat.
- Vanderlinden, Barbara, and Elena Filipovic. 2006. *The Manifesta Decade: Debates on Contemporary Art Exhibitions and Biennials in Post-Wall Europe*. The MIT Press.
- Williams, Deidre. 1997. *How the Arts Measure up: Australian Research into Social Impact*. Comedia Stroud.
- Zuidervaart, Lambert. 2010. *Art in Public: Politics, Economics, and a Democratic Culture*. Cambridge University Press.

## 6. Acknowledgements

"Mobile A2K: Culture and Safety in Africa. Documenting and assessing the impact of cultural events and public art on urban safety" is a research project coordinated by SUPSI, conceived and supported by lettera27 Foundation and co-funded by SNIS The Swiss Network for International Studies. The documentation of Mobile Access to Knowledge is by default under the license Creative Commons attribution share-alike all; you are free to share, copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format and to adapt, remix, transform, and build upon the material for any purpose, even commercially.

<http://www.mobilea2k.org>

### *Research team*

A research project curated by Iolanda Pensa in collaboration with Roberto Casati

Coordination: Davide Fornari

Fernando Alvim, Alfred Anangwe, Emanuela Fanny Bonini Lessing, Serena Cangiano, Lorenzo Cantoni, Marilyn Douala Bell, Ntone Edjabe, Ismail Farouk, Aude Guyot, Inge M. Ruigrok, Sylvie Kandé, Cecilia Liveriero Lavelli, Federica Martini, Luca Morici, Simon Njami, Edgar Arthur Pieterse, Marta Pucciarelli, Isabella Rega, Didier Schaub, Andy Spitz, Fabio Vanin, Caroline Wanjiku Kihato

### *Partners*

African Centre for Cities – University of Cape Town; Chimurenga, Cape Town; doual'Art, Douala; ecav – Ecole Cantonale d'Art du Valais, Sierre; ENST – École Nationale Supérieure des Télécommunications, Paris; Fundação Sindika Dokolo, Luanda; Institut Jean Nicod, Paris; Latitude Platform for Urban Research and Design, Brussels-Venice; Linked Partners, Dakar; NewMinE, Lugano; SUPSI – University of Applied Sciences and Arts of Southern Switzerland, Lugano; University Iuav, Venice; USI – Università della Svizzera italiana, Lugano.